Supreme Court, U.S.
FILED

05-650 OCT 29 2005

OFFICE OF THE CLERK

No.

In The
SUPREME COURT OF THE UNITED STATES

Gregorio Igartua, et. al.

Petitioners

United States

Respondent

Petition for a Writ of Certiorari to the
U.S. Court of Appeals "en banc"
For the First Circuit

PETITION FOR A WRIT OF CERTIORARI

GREGORIO IGARTUA
Attorney for Petitioners & pro se
P.O. Box 3911
Aguadilla, PR 00605
(787)891-9040 / Fax (787)882-3011
bufeteigartua@yahoo.com

QUESTIONS PRESENTED FOR REVIEW

A. WHETHER THE FEDERAL DISTRICT COURT AND THE APPEALS COURT "EN BANC" (1ST CIR) ERRED IN DETERMINING THAT PUERTO RICO CANNOT HAVE ELECTORS WITHOUT A CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT, NOTWITHSTANDING JUDICIAL AND CONGRESSIONAL APPLICABILITY OF CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS TO PUERTO RICO WITHOUT PREVIOUS REQUIREMENT OF AMENDMENT?

B. WHETHER THE FEDERAL DISTRICT COURT, AND THE APPEALS COURT "EN BANC", ERRED IN DETERMINING THAT PETITIONERS REQUEST OF THEIR RIGHT TO VOTE IN PRESIDENTIAL ELECTIONS PRESENTS A POLITICAL QUESTION, OR REQUIRES PUERTO RICO TO BECOME A STATE, DISREGARDING CONSTITUTIONAL APPLICABILITY TO PUERTO RICO WITHOUT POLITICAL OR STATEHOOD REQUIREMENT ?

C. WHETHER THE APPEALS COURT "EN BANC" ERRED IN DETERMINING, IN DEFIANCE TO US CONSTITUTION ART. VI, THAT TREATIES TO WHICH THE UNITED STATES IS SIGNATORY ARE NOT OBLIGATORY, BUT MERE ASPIRATIONAL INSTRUMENTS NOT SUPPORTING PETITIONERS' CLAIM?

D. WHETHER THE COURT OF APPEALS "EN BANC" ERRED IN DENYING PETITIONERS REQUEST FOR DECLARATORY JUDGMENT AND FOR RELIEF, NOTWITHSTANDING DOMESTIC LAW AND TREATY PROVISIONS PROVIDING JUDICIAL REMEDIES FOR PETITIONERS VOTING RIGHTS REQUEST?

THE PARTIES

GREGORIO IGARTUA; CARLOS MENDEZ-MARTINEZ; JORGE IVAN RODRIGUEZ-FELICIANO; RAFAEL ZERUTO SOTO; RAÚL RIVERA-GASCOT; MARICARMEN RIVERA-GASCOT; LUIS R. SOLTERO-HARRINGTON; FRED SOLTERO-HARRINGTON; WANDA RAMOS-MARQUEZ; JORGE LUIS PEREZ-DIAZ; PEDRO MENDEZ-SOTO; VICTOR RODRIGUEZ-VILLANUEVA*

Petitioners

US GOVERNMENT

Respondent

* All Petitioners are 4th, 5th, and 6th generation American citizens residents of Puerto Rico (4 million citizens)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

QUESTIONS PRESENTED FOR REVIEW i

THE PARTIES ii

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES vi

STATEMENT OF JURISDICTION 1

NATURE OF THE CASE 1

CONSTITUTIONAL STATUTORY AND TREATY PROVISIONS 1

PROCEEDINGS BELOW 2

STATEMENT OF FACTS AND REASONS FOR GRANTING THE WRIT 2

ARGUMENT 6

A. *The Federal District Court, and the Appeals Court "en banc" (1st Cir), Erred in Determining that Puerto Rico Cannot Have Electors Without a Constitutional Amendment, Notwithstanding Judicial and Congressional Applicability of Constitutional Provisions to Puerto Rico Without Previous Requirement of Amendment* 6

B. *The Federal District Court, and the Appeals Court "en banc", Erred in Determining that Petitioners Request of Their Right to Vote in Presidential Elections Presents a Political Question, or Requires Puerto Rico to Become a State, Disregarding* 12

Constitutional Applicability to Puerto Rico Without Political or Statehood Requirement

C. *The Appeals Court "en banc" Erred in Determining, in Defiance to US Constitution Art. VI, That Treaties to Which the United States is Signatory Are Not Obligatory, But Mere Aspirational Instruments Not Supporting Petitioners' Claim* 15

D. *The Court Of Appeals "En Banc" Erred in Denying Petitioners Request For Declaratory Judgment and for Relief, Notwithstanding Domestic Law and Treaty Provisions Providing Judicial Remedies for Petitioners Voting Rights Request* 23

CONCLUSION 28

REQUEST FOR RELIEF 29

ANNEXES:

ANNEX A – CIRCUIT COURT OPINION EN BANC 1a

ANNEX B – CIRCUIT COURT MEMORANDUM AND ORDER 82a

ANNEX C – CIRCUIT COURT PANEL OPINION 88a

ANNEX D – PUERTO RICO FEDERAL DISTRICT COURT ORDER DISMISSING THE COMPLAINT 102a

ANNEX E - PUERTO RICO 2000 - PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION BALLOT 111a

ANNEX F - PUERTO RICO MILITARY IN IRAK AND AFGANISTAN 112a

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page

I. Constitutional Provisions

United States Constitution:

Article I 1,
Section 8 2
Article II 1, 7
Section 2 3
Section 3 3
Article III 1, 3, 12, 16
Section 2 26
Article IV 1, 9
Section 2 ..... 2, 26, 27
Section 3 2
Section 4 2
Article VI 1, 3, 5, 10, 15, 16
..... 19, 22, 23, 25, 27
Amendment I 1, 7, 27
Amendment V 27
Amendment XII 1, 7, 10, 19, 27
Amendment XIII 1
Amendment XIV 1, 7, 10, 27
Section 1 2
Section 2 10
Section 5 2
Amendment XV 1, 2, 7, 10, 27
Amendment XIX 1, 10
Amendment XX 1
Amendment XXII 1, 10
Amendment XXIII 1, 10
Amendment XXIV 1, 10
Amendment XXVI 1, 10

Puerto Rico Constitution:

1 L.P.R.A. 247 2

II. Statutory Provisions

3 USCA 1-2[illegible] 8
22 USCA 26. [illegible]c)(2) 21
28 USCA 129[illegible] 1
28 USCA 1331 2
28 USCA 1343 (a) 4, ... 1
28 USCA 1350 18
28 USCA 1651 (a) 1
28 USCA 2101 1
28 USCA 2201 ..... 1, 24, 28
42 U.S.C.A. 1973 ff6 - 1 to 8 8
42 U.S.C.A. 1973 ff8 ..... 1, 5
48 U.S.C.A. 731-916 1
39 Stat. 953 2
64 Stat. 319 2
Voting Rights Act of 1965 ..... 4, 8, 17, 27
42 U.S.C.A. 1971 et. seq.
2002 Help America Vote Act 4, 8, 17, 27
(PUBLIC LAW 107-252–
OCT. 29, 2002)
Law 600 Sec. 2, 1 LPRA 9
US Const Art. IV - 1

III. Treaty Provisions

Treaty Covenant of Civil and 1
Political Rights - 999 UNTS 171
Article 2 ..... 16, 25
Article 25 ..... 16, 19
Article 26 16
Declaration on the Right of 25
Individuals - Article 9
Treaty of Paris 30 States 1754 4
UN Human Rights Declaration 1
(G.A. Res 217 A III A/810, 1948
Article 2 ..... 16, 20
Article 2(1) 17
Article 8 25

Article 21 ..... 16, 20
Article 25 ..... 16, 17, 18
Article 26 16
Article 30 20
Democratic Charter of the 1
Organization of American States
(OAS Doc OEZ/SerP/AG/Res/2001)
Article 1 ..... 22, 23
Article 3 16
Article 11 23
OAS American Declaration of Rights
and Duties of Man
Article 1 22
Article 11 22
Article XX 16, 22
Vienna Convention on the Law of
Treaties,May 23, 1969, 1155
U.N.T.S. 331, 8 I.L.M. 679 –
Article 1 26
Article 11 17
Article 26 ..... 19, 26
Article 27 26
Article 29 26
Article 31 26
Article 46 26
U.N. Charter - Articles 55 and 56 20
OAS Treaty (21 UST 607; TIAS 6847) .. 22

IV. Regulations

U.S. Supreme Court Rule 1f 1

IV. Jurisprudence

Abebe-Jira v. Negewo, 72 F.3d 844, ... 17
848 (11th Cir. 1996)
Adamson v. California, 332 U.S. 24
46, (1947)

Aetna Casualty v. Quailes, 92 F3d.....24
321, 4th. Cir
Alden v. Maine, 119 S.Ct. 2240.....24
Allen v. Wright, 468 U.S. 737, 751.....29
Alvarez-Machain v. United States, ...17, 21, 25
266 F.3d 1045 (9th Cir. 2001,
reversed in 504 U.S. 655
Antilles Cement Corp v. Sila M. 10
Calderon, P.R. Federal District
Court, October 2003, Civil No.
021643 (JP)
Baker v. Carr, 369 U.S. 186.....25
Brown v. Board of Education,.....15, 24, 26, 28
347 U.S. 483, (1954)
Bullock v. Carter, 405 U.S. 134.....11
(1972)
Burson v. Freeman, 504 U.S. 191, ...11
198 (1992)
Bush v. Gore, 121 S CT 525, 529 11
(2000)
Bush v. Gore 531 U.S. 98, at 104.....11
Calero –Toledo v. Pearson Yacht.....9
Leasing Co., 416 U.S. 663
Califano v. Torres, 435 U.S. 3 (1978).....9
Carter v. Dies, 321 F. Supp. 1358, ...11
1361 (D. Tex. 1970)
Cherokee Nation v. Georgia, 30 U.S.....25
1, 17 (1831)
Cohen v. Virginia, 5 L.ed 257, 293.....11
Colegrove v. Green, 328 U.S. 549, ...24
(1946)
Cordova & Simonpietri Ins. 9
Agency Inc. v.Chase Manhattan
Bank, 649 F.2d 36, 39-42
(CA1 1981)
Davis v. Bandemer, 478 U.S. 109.....15
(1986)
Downes v. Bidwell, 182 US 244.....4, 11, 14

Dunn v Blumstein, 405 U.S. 330, ...11, 12
334, 336 (1972)
Examining Board v. Flores de Otero,.....9
426 U.S. 572, 599-601
Exxon Mobil Corp. v. Allapattah.....10
Services Inc., No. 04-70, US
Supreme Court, 6/23/2005
Filatirga v. Pena-Irala, 630 f2d 876,.....25
882-84 (2d Cir 1980)
Galagher v. Indiana State Election 12
Bd, 598 NE 2d 510 (Ind 1992)
Geofroy v. Riggs, 133 US 258.....25
Gideon v. Wainwright, 372 U.S.....24
335, (1963)
Gomillion v. Lightfoot, 364 U.S. 15
339 (1960)
González v. William, 24 Sup. Ct.....2
Rep. 177
Gray v. Sanders, 372 U.S. 368, ...10
380 (1963)
Harman v. Forssenius, 380 U.S.....12
528, 536 (1965)
Harper v. Virginia Bd. of Elections,.....17
383 U.S. 663, (1966)
Igartua v. U.S., 404 F3d. 1 2
Igartua v. U.S.,407 F3d. 30 2
Igartua v. U.S., 229 F3d 80 .....4, 5, 6, 7, 11, 26,
.....27, 28
Illinois State Board of Election v. 12
Socialist Workers Party,
440 US 173
In re Corporación de Servicios.....10
Medicos de Fajardo v. Izquierdo
Mora, 805 F.2d 440 (1986)
Knight v. Florida, 528 U.S. 990 (1999) ..21
Kramer v. Union Free School 12
District No. 15, 395 U.S. 621,
626 (1969)

League of Women Voters v. Diamond, 965 F597 12
Loughborough v. Blake, 18 U.S. 317 9
Malloy v. Hogan, 378 U.S. 1, 4-6, (1964) 24
Marbury v. Madison, 2 L.ed 60, 73 ..... 7, 11
Martin v. Hunter, 4 L.ed 97, 102, 104 11
McCulloch v. Maryland, 4 L.ed 579, 600, 601 11
McIntyre v. Ohio Elections Commission, 514 U.S. 334, 379 (1995) 12
Mora v. Mejias, 115 F.Supp. 610 (PR 1953) 9
O'Brien v. Brown, 409 U.S. 1, 14-15 (1972) 10
Oregon v. Mitchell, 400 US 112 10
Pan American Computer Corp. v. Data General Corp., 562 F.2d 693, 1983 10
Plessy v. Ferguson, 163 U.S. 537 ..... 14, 28
Posadas de P.R. Associate v. Tourism Co. of P.R., 478 US 328 9
Reynolds v. Sims, 377 U.S. 533, 554, 569 (1964) 10, 12, 17
Rivera Carbana v. Cruz, 588 FS 80 (1984) 10
Rodriguez v. Popular Party, 457 US 1 ..... 14, 19
Roe v. Wade, 410 U.S. 113, (1973) 24
Roper v. Simmons, No. 03-633, U.S. Supreme Court, March 1, 2005 25
Sea Land Services v. Municipality of San Juan, 505 F.Supp. 533 (1980) 9
Siderman de Blake v. Republic of Argentina, 965 F2d 699, (9th Cir. 1992) 25
Slaughter House Cases – 83 US 36 3